Seems to me we have two discussions here, one about the differences between two digital formats (DVD and Blu-Ray) and another about the differences between analog and digital (tape or disk). Those are two very different things.

In a way, there's three discussions, with the side-bar being whether vinyl should be preferred over a master tape. But that one kind of answers itself, if you think about it. Of course the master is better, since the vinyl was pressed from it. It's a generation thing, with the vinyl being a copy. Better to have the first recording than a second or third copy, no matter how good those copies are.

For more discusson about analog verses digital, let's make a new thread:
Analog vs Digital Regarding the Blu-Ray vs DVD discussion, to me, Blu-Ray is just plain better than DVD in just about every way. The only thing that isn't better is the price, and even that is becoming less an issue. The sound and picture of Blu-Ray is just so much better, and the prices have fallen to the point there isn't much difference anymore.

I really think the discussion is rapidly becoming moot. Everyone is producing Blu-Ray disks and players at a price point that makes DVD obsolete. If you have old DVD players that can't play Blu-Ray, that's an inconvenience but good Blu-Ray players are so affordable now that it probably makes sense to upgrade.